

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING

OF THE

BOARD OF VISITORS

UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY

25 – 26 September 2014

Approved by the

USAFA BOARD OF VISITORS

3 December 2014

INDEX

TOPIC	PAGE
Attendance	3
Opening Comments	4
Superintendent's Update Part I	4
USAFA Chaplain – Religious Respect Update	7
USAFA Academics Update	7
Athletic Department Update	9
Closed Session Status of Discipline/Investigations	11
USAFA Performance Metrics Update	11
Diversity Panels	12
Academic Tour	12
Schedule of Future Meetings	13
Summary of Follow-On Actions	13

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
BOARD OF VISITORS (BoV)**

UNITED STATES AIR FORCE ACADEMY (USAFA)

The chairman opened the meeting of the USAFA BoV at 0940 on Thursday, 25 September 2014.

ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Alfredo Sandoval (Chair)
Lieutenant General (Ret) Arlen "Dirk" Jameson (Vice Chair)
Representative Doug Lamborn (R-CO)
Maj General (Ret) Marcelite Harris
Dr. Thomas McKiernan
Brigadier General (Ret) Dr. Paula Thornhill
Ms. Sue Hoppin

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Senator Lindsey Graham (R- SC)
Senator Michael Bennet (D-CO)
Senator Jerry Moran (R-KS)
Representative Jared Polis (D-CO)
Representative Niki Tsongas (D-MA)
Mr. Fletcher "Flash" Wiley
One vacant seat for VP Appointment (previously filled by Representative Loretta Sanchez D-CA)
One vacant seat for Speaker of the House Appointment

AIR FORCE SENIOR STAFF:

Mr. Jeffrey Mayo, SAF/MRM
Lieutenant General Sam Cox, AF/A1
Ms. Tina Strickland, GS-15, USAFA BoV Designated Federal Official (DFO)

USAFA SENIOR STAFF:

Lieutenant General Michelle Johnson, Superintendent
Col "Kevin" Lamberth, Vice Superintendent
CMSgt Max Grindstaff, Command Chief Master Sergeant
Brig Gen Mary Hittmeier, Mobilization Assistant to the Superintendent
Brig Gen Stephen Williams, Commandant of Cadets
Brig Gen Andy Armacost, Dean of the Faculty
Dr. Hans Mueh, Director of Athletics
Col Stacey Hawkins, 10 ABW Commander
Col Jerry Szybist, USAFA Prep School Commander
Col Steven Burgh, 306 FTG Commander
Col "Al" Hess, USAFA Liaison
Ms. Gail Colvin, Director of Staff

BoV EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:

Major Mark Cipolla (AF/A1PT)

OPENING COMMENTS

Ms. Strickland opened and welcomed everyone to the quarterly meeting at 0930. She provided a reminder on the BoV rules as related to the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), introduced her team and notified the board that there had been no submissions for a public docket.

BoV CHAIR OPENING REMARKS:

At 0940 the BoV Chair opened the meeting and took roll. He also noted to members of the public in the audience, Mr. Tom Roedder (Colorado Springs Gazette reporter) and Ms. Sue Fulton (USMA BoV Vice Chair). Mr. Sandoval reviewed the approach USAFA had taken in response to the budget cuts the previous year by highlighting its essence to AF senior leadership. He commended Lt Gen Johnson for her strong and capable leadership, thanked her for her efforts, which had garnered SecAF and Air Staff support. He explained that the Board supports the Academy's approach to the budget reductions and has confidence that USAFA is on the correct path. Mr. Sandoval reviewed the Board's priorities for this meeting which included insights from the Superintendent, a religious respect update, Academic and Athletic updates, and a diversity panel the following day. Minutes from the June meeting were approved.

NEW BUSINESS

SUPERINTENDENT'S UPDATE:

Lt Gen Johnson opened stating her appreciation for the BoV members and their actions to assist the USAFA team. She further stated her appreciation to the BoV to approach topics on the annual battle rhythm, including the several topics to be covered during this visit.

Lt Gen Johnson described the budget reductions facing USAFA and the AF over the past year. She explained how the budget reductions drove her team's efforts to distill what it is USAFA delivers, or its' "Essence" – that is, those elements essential to the USAFA experience. She explained how this systematic approach is driving new and innovative ways of delivering the USAFA experience. These efforts align with the July 2014 AF strategy calling for agile and inclusive Airmen. It's the "How" that is changing, not the "What" or the "Why." Despite these efforts, however, she explained that USAFA continues to track the likely impacts and way forward given the on-going, AF-wide budget and personnel reductions.

In order to ensure future resource stability USAFA pursued an aggressive strategy to engage in the AF corporate process. Lt Gen Johnson explained that at this stage, USAFA will continue to be fixed in the execution year for FY15 and FY16, but the AF has estimated that they will ensure long-term stability beginning in the FY17 POM. With USAFA now engaged in the corporate process, the HAF has been providing the support USAFA needs. The BoV Chairman asked how USAFA would be impacted by a continuing resolution. Lt Gen Cox explained that the continuing resolution is unlikely to have any significant impact, but sequestration would be significant.

In addition to impact on the budget, Lt Gen Johnson explained that the on-going force management programs have had minimal impact at USAFA. This is likely to change as the effects of these programs are realized; USAFA is on a slight downward trend in manpower, but is expected to stabilize with a minimal impact in the classroom (e.g., class size may grow by 1.5 – 2 cadets/class for a typical class size of 24). Lt Gen Johnson also highlighted that the reduction in manpower is driving some reductions in the number of majors offered and the number of courses required, which will be phased into the curriculum over the coming years. USAFA will honor the requirements and majors for all cadets

currently at USAFA. In fact, Lt Gen Johnson explained in response to the discussion that some areas will likely see an increase. For example, Cyber is a growth area in the AF and USAFA recently added a Cyber degree to its offering. Mr. Sandoval asked specifically about the reductions in the Athletic Department. Dr. Mueh explained the 30 civilians cut in FY15 are primarily coming from administrative positions and 10 teams will not have a second assistant coach. He further explained the Air Force Academy Athletic Corporation (AFAAC) was working to rehire these coaches, paid for by the AFAAC, though there were some disadvantages (e.g., they can only coach, not teach PE). On a related note, Lt Gen Johnson added that the ad for the new Athletic Director had closed the previous week. She explained that despite her plan to tie it to US government salary scales (\$167-200K), she is hoping USAFA will attract someone that shares our values. The USAFA/A1 further articulated that 50 applicants had responded to the ad and she expected approximately 40 to move through the process as qualified applicants. Lt Gen Johnson explained that a transparent, formal process is key. The next step is a screening panel in early October, which is expected to recommend 10 – 12 candidates for an interview panel in early November. The finalists from the interview panel will then interview directly with Lt Gen Johnson and she'll make her decision in consultation with the AF Chief of Staff in mid to late-December. In response to a question from the Board Chairman regarding the hiring process, Lt Gen Johnson stated USAFA is following the government SES process using 16 essay questions to ensure the applicants can articulate and share the qualities desired at USAFA.

Additionally, Lt Gen Johnson highlighted the potential impacts as the AF establishes the AF Installation and Mission Support Center (AFIMSC). Although USAFA is currently not scheduled to lose any seats, it will change the way it does business. For example, the USAFA Command Post will be integrated with a regional Command Post located at Peterson AFB, i.e., there will no longer be a Command Post located on USAFA. This discussion prompted Dr. Thornhill to suggest the BoV receive additional information from the A4/7 community on the potential impacts to USAFA as AFIMSC becomes operational.

Finally, before describing on-going initiatives, Lt Gen Johnson updated the Board on the on-going hiring process for a new Culture, Climate and Diversity Director who reports directly to her. The grade is likely going to be a GS-15 and as explained in June, is responsible for integrating all the sensors across USAFA. The hire is not expected for several more months.

Following this update on resource stability, Lt Gen Johnson described her on-going initiatives, beginning with how they align with the July 2014 AF strategy, which calls for agile and inclusive Airmen. She explained how much of what USAFA is doing aligns very well with larger AF initiatives. The proposed changes will provide for a more agile graduate. On-going efforts across multiple mission elements will help transition USAFA from a multi-disciplinary approach to an inter-disciplinary approach, which better values the diversity of thought, a hallmark of inclusivity. Lt Gen Johnson pointed out several initiatives she's already implemented like restructuring intramurals to enable participation by more of the Cadet Wing, reviewing the core curriculum to ensure it has the right STEM-liberal arts balance, shifting the 4th-class system to a 4-class system that emphasizes leadership among the upper classes as much as development of the fourthclassmen, encouraging relevant leadership by providing more responsibility to the cadets for their time and decision making, and instituting a commitment review process that shifts the paradigm that returning 2-degrees are invited back to commit to the AF. Despite the positive feedback from these changes, Lt Gen Johnson explained it's a challenge to convince the USAFA graduates and the public that these changes are positive. Hence, USAFA is engaging in a campaign to inform USAFA graduates and let them see first-hand the positive outcomes from these changes. USAFA is working to better articulate this story and the future initiatives USAFA intends to implement in the coming years.

Lt Gen Johnson explained her AY14/15 Commander's Intent has 3 main aspects: a culture of commitment and climate of respect focused on more than just cadets, but also focused on permanent party (i.e., faculty, staff, AOCs, coaches), a mindset that encourages innovation and integration across mission elements, and a focus on refining processes and improving communication. When discussing the culture and climate Lt Gen Johnson addressed some of the on-going concerns in the Athletic Department. She explained some of the data that has caused her concern and articulated what she has done to improve that mission element's culture and climate. In response to a question on how CCLD and the athletic department have partnered, Lt Gen Johnson explained CCLD is developing programs to assist. Although coaches are required to attend new instructor training along with other faculty and staff, they come with widely different backgrounds and hence can benefit from the additional training. Lt Gen Johnson also suggested she is working to better define character clauses in coaches contracts to have more flexibility to hold coaches accountable. She is partnering with AFAAC on this effort and, as an aside, thanked Congressman Lamborn for his efforts on advancing the AFAAC legislation.

Lt Gen Johnson also highlighted the work of Dr. Dave LaRivee's Pathways to Excellence team. This team is experimenting with different opportunities that may better prepare cadets to become the agile and inclusive leaders the AF needs. The programs are designed to expand the cadet experience in a holistic way on both a practical and a leadership level so that cadets are better prepared to overcome adversity. She listed several different programs under consideration including a cadet intermission program that would likely be applied as a pilot program to determine if it achieved the desired outcomes. One aspect of this program could include exchange with ROTC units. The Board requested an update on this.

With respect to the new CCLD, Lt Gen Johnson explained that the building is at approximately 50% complete with an estimated completion date in summer 2015. For the CCLD to serve USAFA, the AF, and the nation, some reorganization and refocusing on the unique scholarship they can offer could be needed.

Before closing Lt Gen (Ret) Jameson asked about the connection between the USAFA Superintendent and other military service academy superintendents. Lt Gen Johnson assured him they remain in close contact formally and informally.

USAFA CHAPLAIN—RELIGIOUS RESPECT UPDATE:

Col (Chaplain) Randy Kitchens provided an update on USAFA's religious respect training. He described how the training expands throughout the 4-year USAFA experience to cover relevant topics such as the balance between the separation clause and the first amendment to the constitution, mutual religious belief, and how to prepare officers to make religious accommodations in their future careers.

Chaplain Kitchens also briefly addressed the pending changes to AFI 1-1. While the changes have not been made known he explained that the religious respect training will be refreshed to accommodate any changes. Lt Gen Jameson and Maj Gen Harris asked if there were any data demonstrating an improvement in religious accommodation – can USAFA perform any trend analysis to show an improving religious climate? Lt Gen Johnson explained that the upcoming BoV will include USAFA climate survey results that may indicate trends.

CM Lamborn expressed his hope that the new AFI 1-1 will "restore balance" to the natural tension between the establishment clause and 1st Amendment.

USAFA ACADEMICS UPDATE:

Brig Gen Andy Armacost updated the BoV on current academic initiatives beginning with the 10-year accreditation cycle. He explained that a major part of this cycle is the “quality initiative,” which is submitted prior to the Higher Learning Commission (HLC) visit, currently scheduled for 2019. The USAFA quality initiative is focused on refinement of USAFA outcomes. While the previous HLC visit found no fault with the listed outcomes, they did suggest that tracking performance on 19 outcomes would likely prove difficult. The Dean has undertaken this quality initiative to align and refine the USAFA academic outcomes.

This discussion prompted the BoV to ask for clarification on their role during the upcoming HLC visit. There is no formal role for the BoV during the 2019 accreditation visit. As a follow-on to this discussion, Lt Gen Johnson highlighted the recent Accreditation Board for Engineering and Technology visit, which will likely result in a 6-year general review for all engineering programs and the computer science program. Following these discussions on accreditation the Dean explained the on-going core curriculum re-design.

As the Dean began the discussion of academic innovations he was asked where the faculty look for ideas to support the core. The Dean explained that the faculty rely on many different sources for best practices, but generally align and share ideas with peer colleges while remaining aligned with the AF. Lt Gen Cox added that the AF is currently working to identify holistic requirements for the AF. The Dean explained that the intent is to move to true interdisciplinary studies. The BoV members acknowledged a desire to endorse a “core curriculum” and recognize the innovative possibilities of these changes as indicators that the USAFA core curriculum is “on the right track.” The Dean added a key debate to any change is how much flexibility to build in the core while ensuring all outcomes are met.

The Dean also explained that a major feature of the proposed change was the establishment of a core oversight board to align courses to ensure they are designed to meet the desired USAFA outcome. BoV endorsed; asked for updates on the Dean’s focus on interdisciplinary approach across the educational spectrum.

The Dean also took this opportunity to brief the Board on several academic innovations on-going at USAFA. He explained how faculty was employing a “flipped classroom” in conjunction with a Stanford-offered Massive Online Open Course to enable improved learning. The Dean also explained a second innovation, which is using Kindle apps in the core philosophy class to enable “deep reading.” Finally, the Dean said they are monitoring innovations via a wide array of other projects. Lt Gen Jameson asked if USAFA uses any single competency exam. The Dean explained USAFA has not, primarily due to the lack of a validated tool.

The Dean closed his remarks by highlighting the efforts to incorporate character development in academic courses. The Department of Behavioral Science and Leadership has partnered with the CCLD to share best practices to include an experimental leadership offering aligning leadership theory taught in class to leadership practice in their cadet squadrons. The Board suggested that this innovation in action be highlighted so that the rest of the AF may benefit.

The Board also asked about the preparation of faculty to embody the AF ethos and incorporate character and leadership development into every faculty. Lt Gen Johnson responded that this is the focus of this year – to ensure faculty are impeccable. The Dean added that some of the education is coming through various reading groups on character, leadership, sexual assault, and diversity. Lt Gen

Johnson suggested that USAFA is seeing positive improvements.

Dr. Thornhill closed this session by asking the Dean to articulate how the faculty remain connected to the AF? Lt Gen Johnson and Brig Gen Armacost both explained that there are very strong ties to the AF.

ATHLETIC DEPARTMENT UPDATE:

Col Kuenzli (USAFA/IG) began this update with a brief introduction to the on-going USAFA/IG inspection of the athletic department. He clarified inspections are used to determine the level of compliance, effectiveness, readiness, discipline and resources.

Col Kuenzli explained this commander's inspection program is a new AF-wide program intended to hold commanders responsible for the compliance of their organizations. Once the athletic department inspection is complete, the USAFA/IG will inspect the Prep School. The BoV asked Col Kuenzli to clarify what he inspected and if he interviewed individuals outside the organization. He clarified that they reviewed regulations, had inspections by experts in technical areas (e.g., finance), and conducted interviews. He would not clarify who he interviewed, but did suggest that anyone is able to come speak with him and his inspectors.

Dr. Mueh provided an Athletic Department update. He acknowledged that culture and climate did not receive the focus they deserved in the past. Dr. Mueh also suggested that the development of coaches is a 'work in progress'.

Dr. Mueh explained that the athletic teams are embarrassed by the stories that have controlled the narrative in the recent press and he acknowledged that the public has a right to hold USAFA to a higher standard than other athletic departments. He and his department leadership are re-emphasizing the need for cadets to lead humbly and take advantage of their athletic prowess to set a positive example.

Dr. Mueh elaborated on a number of on-going programs in the Athletic Department to address culture and climate such as the cadet initiated "pledge" video, the football leadership council, the Respect and Character Enrichment (RACE) program, mentors in violence prevention program, updates to signage in the athletic department, and the student advisory council. This led to a discussion about the participation of intercollegiate cadets within the cadet wing. The Commandant added that there were active steps to help cadet-athletes transition to an attitude of accountability. He suggested they do a great job of holding each other accountable on the athletic fields. They need to maintain that attitude of accountability in their military duties as well.

Finally, Dr. Mueh explained that despite some of the recent narrative in the press, USAFA continues to dominate NCAA sportsmanship awards. Four of the last 6 years USAFA cadet-athletes have been recognized for their sportsmanship. Likewise, cadet-athletes are represented in proportionate numbers on the merit lists.

Mr. Sandoval thanked him for his long service acknowledging this may very well be his last BoV.

CLOSED SESSION:

Chairman Sandoval adjourned the meeting and concluded the day's "open" proceedings. The purpose of the closed session was to discuss cadet discipline, honor, and sexual assault cases. Due to the discussions involving personal information of individual cadet cases the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. Closure of this portion of the meeting is appropriate under 5. U.S.C S. 552b(c)(6).

USAFA PERFORMANCE METRICS UPDATE:

On Friday, 26 September, the BoV reconvened for a final briefing on USAFA Performance Metrics. Col Beineke began the briefing by reminding the board that USAFA had reduced the size of the cadet wing from 4,400 to 4,000 over the past several years, which will impact the performance metric trends.

Annual admission of qualified candidates: This metric showed a change in the number of applicants because USAFA no longer counts Summer Seminar applicants as USAFA applicants. This metric, however, shows a positive increase in the number of qualified candidates.

Pilot qualified Cadets: This metric has remained relatively stable across all demographic groups. Lt Gen Johnson and Mr. Jones (RR) explained USAFA has typically met the pilot requirements established by AF/A1.

Cadets on Academic Probation: The number of cadets on Academic Probation has declined. Dr. Thornhill asked if we can attribute the decline to anything in particular. The Dean explained that it is difficult to attribute the improvement to any one thing, but emphasis on academic leadership positions in the cadet wing, the academic working group that meets with him periodically, and the establishment of "academic" rooms in many of the squadrons are likely factors.

Cadets on Athletic Probation: The number of cadets on athletic probation is now below 100. This decrease is likely attributable to several of the structural improvements in weight rooms such as a weight room dedicated to the reconditioning program (RECONDO), and renewed emphasis on the execution of the RECONDO program.

Involuntary and Voluntary Attrition: No major trend

Prep School Admission Rate: Col Beineke explained that 73% of prior enlisted cadets attending USAFA begin their journey at the Prep School. She also explained that the Prep School is a primary method of meeting congressional requirements. The BoV suggested that this is a good news story and the AF should advertise it more. Recently Prep School cadets attrit at a 5% rate above direct entry cadets. Col Beineke explained that USAFA had taken some risk in previous Prep School year groups. USAFA has adjusted to decrease the risk level of applicants. Lt Gen Johnson elaborated that USAFA is working to get at concepts like "grit" to determine future performance.

This session closed with a discussion on the applicant pool. The BoV along with USAFA senior leadership acknowledged that this is a difficult task due to a decreasing pool of qualified applicants among the US public.

Finally, there was significant discussion on how to best tell these good news stories. Ms. Hoppin and Lt Gen Jameson, with the support of several other BoV member suggested a campaign that uses

articles/blogs, etc., to tell the USAFA story may be an opportunity to advertise the quality initiatives on-going at USAFA.

Before the end of this session, the BoV asked about the process for Prep School admissions and whether non-cognitive tools are being used to get at more than just academics. Mr. Jones explained they're trying, but this is a difficult problem. Lt Gen Johnson added that the AF is working this on the enlisted side to find improved ways to increase the number of qualified applicants.

DIVERSITY PANELS:

A BoV subcommittee met with a group of diverse cadets in closed session. A second subcommittee met with a group of diverse faculty and staff. These subcommittees will out-brief the results of these panels at the December BoV.

ACADEMIC TOUR:

The Diversity panels were followed by a tour of the Academic innovations the Dean discussed during the academic update the day prior. This include a visit to the cyber lab, a discussion with Scholarship on Teaching and Learning researchers, and a meeting with faculty from the Department of Management and the Department of Research on innovation and technology transfer.

2014 SCHEDULE OF FUTURE MEETINGS:

3 December in DC

SUMMARY OF FOLLOW-ON ACTIONS:

MARK E. CIPOLLA, Maj, USAF
Executive Secretary

ALFREDO A. SANDOVAL
Chair, USAFA Board of Visitors